

Resource Competence Development for State Apparatus as an Improvement Effort Quality of Public Services

Choirul Saleh¹, Novi Puspitasari²

¹Faculty of Administrative Science, Universitas Brawijaya
Jl. MT. Haryono, Malang, 65145, Indonesia

² Faculty of Administrative Science, Universitas Brawijaya
Jl. MT. Haryono, Malang, 65145, Indonesia

Article history:

Received: 2025-11-02

Revised: 2025-23-02

Accepted: 2024-25-02

Published : 2025-28-02

✉ Corresponding Author:

Choirul Saleh:

E-mail: choirulsaleh@ub.ac.id

Abstract

Improving the competencies of state apparatus resources is essential for enhancing the quality of public services, which is crucial for fostering public trust in government and creating an effective and responsive state. This research explores the approaches and strategies used to develop competencies among state apparatus resources and analyzes their impact on public service quality. Employing a qualitative approach, the study examines the classification, developmental steps, quality of outcomes, and supportive factors influencing competency enhancement at the State University of Brawijaya, Malang, Indonesia. The findings reveal key strategies for fostering competencies that align with contemporary demands, including targeted training programs and institutional support mechanisms. These efforts contribute to improving public service delivery and supporting national development. The study offers insights into competency development in higher education settings, highlighting its role in advancing public service quality and reinforcing the nation's progress.

Keywords: Competency Development; Human Resources; Public Services; State Apparatus; Workforce.

JEL Classification: H83; J24; M53

1. Introduction

The quality and equality of access to higher education remain key indicators for assessing the success of public services in the education sector. As highlighted by Camilleri (2021), public service effectiveness is closely tied to equitable treatment and justice in service delivery. Gaster & Rutqvist (2000) emphasize that the quality of public services hinges on equality and justice, ensuring that services are fairly distributed across different societal groups without bias. This approach transcends mere theoretical considerations, as equitable treatment fosters public trust and strengthens institutions. Equality, as defined by Gaster & Rutqvist (2000), implies that every individual or group within society receives uniform treatment without any form of discrimination. Justice, on the other hand, entails ensuring that services and resources are allocated fairly based on individuals' specific needs and rights (Irawan, 2016). These principles are foundational to enhancing public trust and the effectiveness of service delivery, contributing to inclusive and sustainable development goals (Setyono, 2015; Uyyun, 2021).

Central to achieving these principles is the role of state apparatus competency. Rampersad (2006) asserts that the competence of state officials directly impacts the quality of services provided to the community. Competence, encompassing knowledge, skills, and attitudes, is critical to improving individual and organizational performance. It can be developed and adapted over time, incorporating elements of performance management, motivation, and leadership (Pralhad & Hamel, 1994). Particularly in higher education, competent human resources are vital for enhancing the quality and efficiency of educational services. Competency development

among education administrative staff aligns with the goals of ensuring effective public service and meeting the changing demands of the education sector.

This study explores the development of human resource competencies within public sector organizations, focusing on its impact on service quality in higher education. Specifically, it examines two human resource management approaches: Human Resource Management (HRM), which views employees as passive and an expense, and Human Capital Management (HCM), which regards employees as assets adding value to the organization. This perspective aligns with (Gaster, 1995), Gaster & Rutqvist (2000), and Prahalad & Hamel (1994), who emphasize that competency development represents a critical investment for enhancing service quality and organizational performance.

By analyzing empirical, theoretical, and methodological issues, this research aims to contribute to the existing literature on public sector human resource management, particularly in the context of higher education. Through the lens of Human Capital Management, the study underscores the importance of treating human resources as valuable assets, essential for achieving sustainable development and improving the overall quality of public services. This investigation also identifies strategies to address the challenges of competency development, providing insights for enhancing administrative efficiency and responding to the evolving demands of the education sector.

2. Method, Data, and Analysis

This study employs a qualitative research methodology to explore the development of State Apparatus (State Civil Apparatus) competencies at the University of Brawijaya, Malang, East Java, Indonesia. The qualitative approach was chosen to gain in-depth insights into the strategies, practices, and challenges associated with human resource competency development within the context of a complex higher education institution. The participants of this research include key informants from the human resource (HR) departments and administrative staff at various organizational levels within the University of Brawijaya. These individuals were purposively selected based on their roles and expertise in managing and implementing HR competency development programs. The inclusion of these participants ensures a comprehensive understanding of competency-related issues from both strategic and operational perspectives. The data for this study were collected through a combination of semi-structured interviews, direct observations, and documentation reviews. Semi-structured interviews were conducted with HR personnel and administrative staff to capture their experiences, perceptions, and challenges in competency development. Observations were carried out to gain firsthand insights into the daily operations and practices within the HR departments. Additionally, relevant documents, including training policies, program guidelines, and institutional reports, were reviewed to provide contextual support and triangulate the data obtained from interviews and observations (Rustipa et al., 2024). The analysis of the collected data followed a three-stage process: data collection, data presentation, and data verification. In the data collection phase, detailed notes and recordings were systematically compiled to ensure completeness. During the data presentation phase, the data were organized and categorized into themes and subthemes reflecting key aspects of competency development. Finally, the data verification phase involved cross-checking information from multiple sources to ensure validity and reliability. Triangulation was applied to confirm the consistency of findings across interviews, observations, and documents. This qualitative methodology provides a detailed understanding of how human resource competency development contributes to enhancing the quality of public services in higher education. The purposive selection of participants, rigorous data collection methods, and structured analysis ensure that the study captures the complexities and dynamics of competency development in the public sector. The findings are expected to offer valuable insights for designing and implementing effective competency development programs in similar institutional contexts..

3. Results

The University of Brawijaya is one of Indonesia's foremost universities, offering a comprehensive array of educational opportunities through its 16 faculties and a Postgraduate School, covering a vast spectrum of academic disciplines. The Faculty of Law provides bachelor's, master's, and doctoral programs, while the Faculty of Economics and Business (FEB), established in 1961, encompasses three departments with 14 study programs, including Accounting and Management. The Faculty of Administrative Sciences (FIA) coordinates 11 study programs, such as Business Administration and Higher Education Management. The Faculty of Agriculture and

Engineering offer 13 and 18 study programs, including Agribusiness, Agricultural Economics, Civil Engineering, and Mechanical Engineering.

The Faculty of Medicine, Fisheries, and Marine Sciences contribute to health and aquatic sciences with programs like Medicine, Aquatic Resource Management, and Aquaculture. The Faculty of Mathematics and Natural Sciences (FMIPA) provides programs with superior accreditation. Other faculties, including the Faculty of Agricultural Technology, Faculty of Social and Political Sciences (FISIP), and Faculty of Cultural Sciences, offer diverse study programs. The Faculty of Veterinary Medicine, Computer Science, Faculty of Dentistry, Faculty of Health Sciences, and Faculty of Vocational Studies further expand the University of Brawijaya's role in diverse academic fields. Additionally, the university operates a Postgraduate School with extensive master's and doctoral programs and off-campus programs in Jakarta and Kediri, broadening its reach in higher education.

In the context of rising public demand for quality services, especially in tertiary education, Gaebler & Osborne (1919) principles highlight that superior public services are fundamental in addressing society's complex and varied needs. As a governmental institution, universities are pivotal in delivering public services, particularly education, research, and community engagement Nasi & Choi, (2023).

The University of Brawijaya symbolizes academic excellence and intellectual advancement, serving as a beacon for younger generations. Beyond this esteemed role, the university is responsible for delivering exemplary public services. Recognizing the need to meet ever-evolving service demands, the University of Brawijaya has implemented strategic initiatives, particularly in state apparatus competency development, to enhance the quality of its public services.

The state apparatus competency development program at the University of Brawijaya is designed to enhance the capabilities and knowledge of its staff. Activities include intensive training sessions, workshops, practical training, and technical and interpersonal skills development. Perry & Wise (1990) emphasize that individual competency development is essential for improving organizational effectiveness and public services. In addition to these programs, the university fosters an organizational culture centred on innovation, continuous learning, and inter-departmental collaboration. Walker et al. (2010) argue that a culture of learning and collaboration positively impacts overall organizational performance. This dual approach – enhancing individual competencies and cultivating an innovative organizational culture – positions the University of Brawijaya to improve its public service offerings sustainably.

University of Brawijaya's initiatives underscore its commitment to delivering exceptional public services through strategic investments in human resources and organizational culture. In a dynamic global environment, emphasizing human resource development as a cornerstone of public service is increasingly vital. The university exemplifies a higher education institution integrating academic knowledge transfer with professionalism and excellence in public administration. By investing in state apparatus competencies and fostering a progressive organizational culture, the University of Brawijaya meets current demands and builds a foundation for sustained service quality in the future.

Personal Competency Map of State Civil Apparatus (state apparatus) Resources in University of Brawijaya

The University of Brawijaya has implemented a Personal Competency Map for all State Civil Servant (state apparatus) resources within its organization. This map focuses on four primary dimensions: knowledge, skills, abilities, and other characteristics. These dimensions form the foundation for understanding and developing the competencies of its workforce.

1. Knowledge Dimension

This dimension pertains to a comprehensive understanding of the field of study or specialization essential for performing assigned duties. For instance, administrative staff must possess in-depth knowledge of academic administration procedures and data management.

2. Skills Dimension

Practical skills required to complete specific tasks fall under this category. Examples include proficiency in specialized software for database management or practical communication skills necessary for interactions with students, faculty, and colleagues.

3. Ability Dimension

This dimension focuses on applying acquired knowledge and skills in real-world scenarios. It encompasses analytical thinking, problem-solving abilities, and adaptability to changing work environments.

4. Other Characteristics Dimension

This includes attitude, motivation, work ethic, and collaboration skills. Key traits like integrity, openness, and a cooperative mindset are essential for enhancing overall performance.

As Walker et al. (2010), highlight, “Individual characteristics such as motivation and attitudes towards work significantly impact team member performance in an organizational environment”.

By assessing state apparatus competencies across these four dimensions, the University of Brawijaya identifies development needs, designs targeted training programs, and improves the overall quality of public services. This strategic approach strengthens the capacity of state apparatus to tackle complex challenges in a dynamic environment.

Classification Based on Core Competencies at the University of Brawijaya

In developing the competencies of state civil servants, the University of Brawijaya utilizes a classification based on core competencies. This framework identifies essential skills and knowledge required for effective performance.

1. General Core Competency

These are foundational skills relevant to almost all roles at the university, such as: effective communication, teamwork, analytical thinking, and problem-solving.

These general competencies underpin success in various roles within the university.

2. Specific Core Competency

These competencies are specialized and directly related to specific roles or responsibilities. For example: Administrative staff require expertise in higher education administrative processes, academic data management, and proficiency in relevant software. Other staff may require domain-specific skills tied to their departmental duties.

3. Benefits of Classification

By classifying competencies into general and specific categories, the University of Brawijaya can: Develop targeted training programs that address specific needs. Efficiently allocate resources for competency development. This structured approach ensures that staff acquire skills aligned with their roles and responsibilities, ultimately improving operational efficiency and public service quality (University of Brawijaya, 2024).

As outlined in the University of Brawijaya Strategic Plan 2020-2024, available on the university’s official website, the institution strongly emphasizes identifying and nurturing core competencies. This aligns with its commitment to equip the state apparatus with the skills necessary to meet job demands effectively. By adhering to this principle, the university ensures its workforce is well-prepared to uphold its mission of delivering excellence in public service.

Classification Based on Competency Level

In the development of state civil servant (state apparatus) competencies at University of Brawijaya, classification based on competency levels is an essential part of devising effective development strategies. The framework of Manninen & Viitala Levels (Laakso-Manninen & Viitala, 2007) is used to categorize and plan competency development across six levels, enabling a structured approach to addressing the skills and knowledge required for various roles.

1. Level 0: Basic Level

At this level, state apparatus requires fundamental knowledge and general skills necessary for performing their duties.

2. Level 1: Operational Level

Here, the focus is on a deeper understanding of job responsibilities, allowing the state apparatus to perform effectively in routine situations.

3. Level 2: Procedural Level

Competencies at this level emphasize the ability to operate complex procedures and address work-related problems efficiently.

4. Level 3: Managerial Level

At this stage, state apparatus must demonstrate the ability to manage projects, teams, and resources effectively.

5. Level 4: Strategic Level

Competencies here involve a broad understanding of organizational goals, with the ability to develop strategies to achieve them.

6. Level 5: Visionary

Level This highest level expects state apparatus to lead in strategic decision-making, inspire others, and motivate teams to realize the organization's vision and goals.

Using this classification, University of Brawijaya can conduct comprehensive analyses of competency needs across various organizational levels. This ensures the development of tailored programs that enhance operational, managerial, or strategic skills. As a result, the university ensures its state apparatus possesses the required competencies to deliver high-quality public services.

Gaps in Personal Competency in Apparatus Resources

The competency gap in apparatus resources, particularly in the context of Street-Level Bureaucrats (SLBs) and programs like EPS-G2 (Empowering and Strengthening Teachers-G2), is a significant issue that impacts the quality of public services in higher education. Street-Level Bureaucrats are government employees directly interacting with the public to deliver services. They possess discretionary power to implement policies but often work under constrained resources and tight schedules. According to Weatherley & Lipsky (1977), while their discretion allows for flexibility, it also comes with responsibility, requiring them to make challenging decisions with limited information. For SLBs to be effective, they must receive adequate qualifications and training. However, gaps in pre-service and in-service training often hinder their professional development.

Street-level bureaucrats refer to government employees who interact directly with the public in providing public services. They have discretionary power and often work under tight resources and time pressures. Adequate qualifications and training are essential for SLBs to carry out their role effectively. Their direct interactions with the community provide a deep understanding of the needs and challenges faced by these individuals. Meanwhile, EPS-G2 is an abbreviation for “Empowering and Strengthening Teachers-G2”, which is a development program to strengthen and empower teachers in improving the quality of education for students.

This research highlights several factors that cause gaps in the personal competence of apparatus resources in higher education, especially in the context of Street Level Bureaucrats and the EPS-G2 program. One of the main factors is the lack of adequate training before and during the implementation of tasks. Pre-service training programs may not provide Street Level Bureaucrats with sufficient knowledge and skills to face challenges in the field. Additionally, the availability of in-service training is often limited, resulting in a lack of professional development and ongoing skills enhancement for Street Level Bureaucrats. This could be an obstacle to improving the quality of public services, especially in the context of higher education.

This research also shows that the distribution of quality teachers across regions and institutions may be uneven, leading to disparities in the quality of education received by students. Districts with fewer qualified teachers may face challenges in providing comprehensive support to students. The EPS-G2 program, as an effort to strengthen and empower teachers in higher education, has great potential to overcome the gap in personal competency of apparatus resources. However, the success of this program depends on addressing the root of the problem. By providing adequate pre-service training, expanding in-service training opportunities, encouraging the equal distribution of qualified teachers, and establishing clear career paths and incentives, the EPS-G2 program can be an effective solution in overcoming the gap in personal competency resources in tertiary institutions.

University of Brawijaya is Steps in Implementing the Competency Development Program

The steps for implementing personal competency development for all officials at the Street Level Bureaucrats level at University of Brawijaya Malang show directed efforts to improve the quality of public services. This process includes several important stages designed to optimize the potential of existing human resources. Steps for implementing personal competency development for all officials at street level bureaucrats include:

1. Planning for competency development of civil service resources: The government must prepare a clear and specific competency development plan for each employee of the state civil service (state apparatus). This plan must consider the needs of the position, capabilities, and goals of the organization
2. Implementation of competency development for apparatus resources: Implementation of competency development must be carried out effectively and efficiently. Training must involve special skills or techniques that can be demonstrated and observed in the workplace. Training should focus on increasing the ability to perform current tasks
3. Competency management of apparatus resources: Competency management must include three main aspects, namely:
 - a) Competency maintenance activities: The government must provide opportunities for state apparatus to improve the competencies they already have.
 - b) Competency strengthening and adjustment activities: The government must provide opportunities for state apparatus to develop competencies to the needs of the position and organization.

- c) Competency evaluation activities: The government must evaluate the quality of existing state apparatus personal competencies to determine the abilities that have been acquired and to improve the competencies that need to be improved

The steps for implementing the program to strengthen or increase the personal competence of apparatus resources that have been and are being carried out by University of Brawijaya Malang are classified into three categories consisting of:

1. Based on type: Formal development and informal development
2. Based on the form of activity: On the job training, of the-job training, and learning by doing
3. Based on the nature of the activity: Familiarization or internalization of new competencies, maintenance, and improvement of existing apparatus resource competencies, as well as evaluation of the quality of personal competency of existing apparatus resources

In implementing competency development, it is important to consider the needs of the position, abilities, and organizational goals. Competency development must be carried out effectively and efficiently, by focusing on increasing the ability to carry out current tasks. Competency management must include three main aspects, namely competency maintenance activities, competency strengthening and adjustment activities, and competency evaluation activities.

Quality of Competency Development Results

The competency development program carried out by University of Brawijaya in Malang has provided significant results in improving the quality of educational services provided. In research conducted by the University of Brawijaya team, there was a significant improvement in reducing competency gaps between apparatus resources. This reduction in the level of competency gaps is an indicator of the success of the competency development program carried out.

Through a comprehensive and targeted approach, University of Brawijaya has been able to improve the knowledge, skills, and abilities of its personnel, which in turn improves the quality of educational services provided to students. By reviewing the reduction in the level of competency gaps, University of Brawijaya can evaluate the effectiveness of the competency development programs that have been implemented.

The results of this research show that investment in developing the competency of apparatus resources has a positive impact on improving the quality of educational services. By improving personnel competency, University of Brawijaya can be more responsive to student needs and able to organize more effective and relevant educational programs. In this study, we can see that evaluation of the quality of competency development results is carried out through analysis of the level of reduction in competency gaps. This provides an in-depth understanding of the impact of the competency development program on the quality of educational services provided by University of Brawijaya.

Supporting and Inhibiting Factors for Development Activities

In carrying out competency development activities for apparatus resources at University of Brawijaya Malang, some factors support and inhibit the process. Analysis of these factors can provide important insights for planning and implementing more effective competency development programs in the future.

First, supporting factors include aspects of interest and talent possessed by officials, especially street-level bureaucrats. Strong interest and talent in a particular field can be a motivation for officials to continue developing their competencies. Apart from that, the existence of adequate facilities and facilities is also a supporting factor. Complete and adequate facilities, such as libraries, seminar rooms, and access to technology supporting competency development, can increase the effectiveness of development programs. However, on the other hand, there are inhibiting factors that need to be overcome. One of them is limited funds or financing for competency development activities. Development programs require significant investment, and limited funds can hinder the optimal implementation of these programs. Apart from that, aspects of employee mutation and rotation can also be an obstacle, because they can disrupt continuity in competency development.

In this research, it is important to recognize that the research focus is emergent or tentative. This means that research results can develop over time and the discovery of new problems in the research location. This shows the importance of continuing research to understand in more depth the dynamics of the factors that influence competency development activities at University of Brawijaya Malang.

4. Discussion

The results of this study demonstrate that the competency development initiatives implemented by the University of Brawijaya have significantly enhanced the quality of public services in higher education. This discussion aims to analyze the underlying reasons for these outcomes, supported by theoretical perspectives and evidence, while addressing the gaps and proposing contributions to scientific development.

Competency Development as a Pillar of Public Service Quality

The success of the University of Brawijaya's competency development program can be attributed to its systematic and strategic approach. By implementing a Personal Competency Map, the university has successfully identified and addressed the specific knowledge, skills, abilities, and personal characteristics needed for state apparatus personnel. Theories of human resource management, such as those proposed by Perry & Wise (1990), underscore that individual competencies are directly linked to organizational effectiveness. The results of this study align with this assertion, as the competency development initiatives at the university have led to a measurable reduction in competency gaps and improved the delivery of educational services.

The classification of competencies into general and specific categories, as well as the use of the Manninen & Viitala framework for competency levels, has provided a structured approach to human resource development. This structured methodology ensures that training programs are tailored to the needs of both individuals and organizational goals. The findings indicate that this approach has enhanced operational efficiency, managerial effectiveness, and strategic alignment, thus addressing the gap between current staff capabilities and the demands of a dynamic educational environment.

Addressing Gaps in Competency Development

The study highlights several challenges, including gaps in pre-service and in-service training and the uneven distribution of qualified personnel. These findings are consistent with Weatherley & Lipsky's (1977) concept of Street-Level Bureaucrats, which emphasizes the critical role of front-line staff in policy implementation and service delivery. The lack of adequate training and resource constraints hampers their ability to perform effectively. However, programs such as EPS-G2 have shown promise in addressing these gaps by empowering educators and administrative staff with necessary skills and support.

The results suggest that addressing competency gaps requires a multifaceted approach, including expanded training opportunities, equitable distribution of resources, and robust career development pathways. This study contributes to the literature by demonstrating that targeted competency development programs can bridge the gap between individual capabilities and institutional expectations, thereby enhancing public service quality.

Supporting and Inhibiting Factors

The analysis of supporting and inhibiting factors reveals critical insights into the dynamics of competency development. The presence of motivated personnel and adequate facilities has been instrumental in the success of training programs. However, financial constraints and frequent staff rotations present significant barriers. These findings align with Walker et al. (2010), who argue that a culture of learning and collaboration is essential for overcoming structural and operational challenges.

By fostering a culture of innovation and continuous learning, the University of Brawijaya has mitigated some of these challenges, creating an environment conducive to professional growth and improved service delivery. The integration of organizational culture with competency development initiatives highlights the importance of a holistic approach to human resource management.

Contribution to Science and Practice

This study contributes to the field of human resource development by providing empirical evidence on the effectiveness of structured competency development frameworks in higher education. The classification of competencies and the use of a competency level framework offer a replicable model for other institutions seeking to enhance their public service quality. Furthermore, the study addresses the gap in understanding the role of organizational culture in competency development, emphasizing its impact on fostering innovation and collaboration.

From a practical perspective, the findings provide actionable insights for policymakers and educational institutions. By investing in human capital and addressing systemic challenges, organizations can improve service quality and respond effectively to societal demands. The University of Brawijaya's approach serves as a model for integrating academic excellence with professional competence, ensuring sustained contributions to public service excellence.

Addressing Future Challenges

While the results highlight significant achievements, the emergent nature of competency development requires ongoing research. The dynamic nature of public service demands continuous evaluation and adaptation of training programs to address new challenges. Future studies could explore the long-term impact of competency development initiatives and the role of technology in enhancing training effectiveness.

In conclusion, the University of Brawijaya's competency development programs demonstrate that targeted investments in human resources, coupled with a supportive organizational culture, can significantly improve public service quality. This study provides a foundation for further exploration and application of competency development frameworks in diverse institutional contexts.

5. Conclusion and Limitations

Conclusion

This research highlights the critical importance of improving public services, particularly in the higher education sector, where universities play a central role in education, research, and community service. The University of Brawijaya, as a prominent higher education institution, has taken strategic steps to address the growing demand for quality public services through the implementation of competency development programs for its state apparatus. These programs, incorporating training, workshops, and interpersonal skill development, have proven effective in enhancing the efficiency and responsiveness of services provided. From an empirical perspective, the study provides evidence that structured competency development initiatives, supported by organizational culture fostering innovation and collaboration, significantly contribute to organizational performance. The implementation of a personal competency map at the University of Brawijaya has enabled the identification of individual development needs and the design of targeted training programs. By classifying competencies based on core levels and job-specific roles, the university has ensured that its personnel possess the skills and knowledge required to meet institutional goals.

The research also addresses the theoretical importance of bridging competency gaps, particularly in programs like EPS-G2, which emphasize the need for adequate pre-service and in-service training and equitable distribution of qualified personnel. These efforts align with existing theories of human resource development and organizational effectiveness, reinforcing the idea that investment in human capital is crucial for achieving sustained public service excellence. Economically, the study underscores the value of strategic investments in competency development, as these initiatives enhance operational efficiency and reduce disparities in service delivery, ultimately benefiting students, stakeholders, and society at large. The results suggest that such programs are not only cost-effective but also essential for building a workforce capable of adapting to the complexities of modern public service demands.

New findings from this research include the practical application of competency classifications and levels tailored to the higher education context. The structured framework utilized by the University of Brawijaya serves as a model for other institutions aiming to improve their human resource capabilities and public service quality. Additionally, the identification of supporting and inhibiting factors provides actionable insights for refining competency development strategies. For future research, studies could explore the long-term impact of competency development programs, the integration of technology in training initiatives, and the potential for expanding these frameworks to other sectors. This research contributes to the existing literature by offering a replicable and adaptable approach to enhancing public service quality through strategic human resource development.

Limitations

While this research provides valuable insights into the competency development initiatives at the University of Brawijaya, several limitations should be acknowledged. First, the study is limited in scope to a single institution, which may affect the generalizability of the findings. The unique organizational structure and cultural context of the University of Brawijaya might not fully represent other higher education institutions, particularly those with different governance models or resource availability. Second, the research primarily relies on qualitative data collection methods, such as interviews, observations, and document analysis. While these methods offer depth and rich insights, they are inherently subjective and may introduce bias, particularly in interpreting participant perspectives. A mixed-method approach incorporating quantitative measures could provide a more robust validation of the findings. Third, the study's focus on competency development in state apparatus personnel limits the exploration of broader systemic factors, such as policy frameworks or macroeconomic conditions, that may influence the effectiveness of public service delivery. These external factors could have affected the results but were not directly examined in this research. Finally, the dynamic and emergent

nature of competency development initiatives means that the findings are time-sensitive. The rapidly changing demands of public services, advancements in technology, and shifts in educational priorities may render some aspects of this research less applicable over time.

References

- Arthur, J. B. (1994). Effects of Human Resource Systems on Manufacturing Performance and Turnover. *Academy of Management Journal*, 37(3), 670–687. <https://doi.org/10.5465/256705>
- Baker, M. A., & Kim, K. (2020). Dealing with customer incivility: The effects of managerial support on employee psychological well-being and quality-of-life. *International Journal of Hospitality Management*, 87, 102503. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ijhm.2020.102503>
- Bassi, L., & McMurrer, D. (2007). Maximizing your return on people. *Harvard Business Review*, 85(3), 115.
- Becker, G. S. (1975). Investment in human capital: effects on earnings. In *Human Capital: A Theoretical and Empirical Analysis, with Special Reference to Education, Second Edition* (pp. 13–44). NBER.
- Camilleri, M. A. (2021). Evaluating service quality and performance of higher education institutions: a systematic review and a post-COVID-19 outlook. *International Journal of Quality and Service Sciences*, 13(2), 268–281. <https://doi.org/10.1108/IJQSS-03-2020-0034>
- Chairiah, A., Ariski, S., Nugroho, A., Suhariyanto, A., & others. (2020). Implementasi Sistem Merit pada Aparatur Sipil Negara di Indonesia. *Jurnal Borneo Administrator*, 16(3), 383–400.
- Chen, S., Jiang, W., Li, X., & Gao, H. (2021). Effect of employees' perceived green HRM on their workplace green behaviors in oil and mining industries: Based on cognitive-affective system theory. *International Journal of Environmental Research and Public Health*, 18(8), 4056.
- Clark, D. J. (2019). *Understanding Employee Engagement: An Examination of Millennial Employees and Perceived Human Resource Management Practices*. University of South Florida.
- Davis, T. S., Reno, R., Guada, J., Swenson, S., Peck, A., Saunders-Adams, S., & Haas-Gehres, L. (2019). Social Worker Integrated Care Competencies Scale (SWICCS): Assessing social worker clinical competencies for health care settings. *Social Work in Health Care*, 58(1), 75–92.
- Dessler, (2018). Human Resource Management: Personnel Human Resource Management. In *Mismain.Bsa.Kent.Edu* (Vol. 6, Issue January 2009). John Wiley & Sons.
- Edwards-Johnson, J., Phillips, J., & Wendling, A. (2018). The Public Service Loan Forgiveness program should be reformed, not eliminated. *Academic Medicine*, 93(7), 959.
- Ende, E., Sulaimawan, D., Sastaviana, D., Lestariningsih, M., Rozanna, M., Mario, A., Mahmudah, S., Bayudhirgantara, E. M., Johannes, R., Marry, F., & others. (2023). *Manajemen sumber daya manusia*.
- Fitria, F., Suryanto, S., & Mashuri, M. A. (2022). Strategi Pengembangan Kompetensi Aparatur Sipil Negara dalam Mewujudkan World Class Government. *Societas: Jurnal Ilmu Administrasi Dan Sosial*, 11(1), 42–53.
- Follmer, E. H., Talbot, D. L., Kristof-Brown, A. L., Astrove, S. L., & Billsberry, J. (2018). Resolution, relief, and resignation: A qualitative study of responses to misfit at work. *Academy of Management Journal*, 61(2), 440–465.
- Gaebler, T., & Osborne, D. (1919). *Reinventing Government: How the Entrepreneurial Spirit is Transforming the Public Sector*. -.
- Gaster, L. (1995). Quality in Public Services. *Open University Press, Buckingham*.
- Gaster, L., & Rutqvist, H. (2000). Changing the Front Line to Meet Citizen Needs. *Local Government Studies*, 26(2), 53–70. <https://doi.org/10.1080/03003930008433989>
- Harris, C. M., & Brown, L. W. (2021). Does human capital pay? The influence of leader human capital and employee human capital on leader bonus earnings. *Journal of Organizational Effectiveness*, 8(1), 1–15. <https://doi.org/10.1108/JOEPP-03-2020-0029>
- Herrera, J., & Miller, D. M. (2018). An emergent taxonomy of public personnel management: exploring the task environment of human resource managers in Spanish local government. *Public Personnel Management*, 47(4), 445–471.
- Huselid, M. A., & Barnes, J. E. (2003). Human capital measurement systems as a source of competitive advantage. *Retrieved November, 30, 2010*.
- Irawan, D. B. (2016). Kapasitas Organisasi dan Pelayanan Publik. *Jakarta: Publica Press*, 74.
- Jones, K., Scullion, L., Hynes, C., & Martin, P. (2022). Accessing and sustaining work after Service: the role of Active Labour Market Policies (ALMP) and implications for HRM. *International Journal of Human*

- Resource Management*, 1–22. <https://doi.org/10.1080/09585192.2022.2133574>
- Kasemsap, K. (2016). Developing a framework of human resource management, organizational learning, knowledge management capability, and organizational performance. In *Project Management: Concepts, Methodologies, Tools, and Applications* (pp. 371–402). IGI Global.
- Laakso-Manninen, R., & Viitala, R. (2007). *Competence management and human resource development: a theoretical framework for understanding the practices of modern Finnish organisations*.
- Lee, J. B., & Kim, S. (2024). Understanding gaps between objective and subjective performance measures: Accreditation of public service organizations and citizen satisfaction. *The American Review of Public Administration*, 54(3), 271–286.
- Magee, C., Gordon, R., Robinson, L., Caputi, P., & Oades, L. (2017). Workplace bullying and absenteeism: The mediating roles of poor health and work engagement. *Human Resource Management Journal*, 27(3), 319–334.
- Murray-Smith, R., & Johansen, T. (2020). *Multiple model approaches to nonlinear modelling and control*. CRC press.
- Mustamin, M. (2023). Manajemen Talenta dan Pengembangan Kompetensi Aparatur Sipil Negara (ASN): Mengoptimalkan Kinerja Aparatur Sipil Negara (ASN). *Jurnal Sipatokong BPSDM SULSEL*, 4(2), 165–175.
- Nasi, G., & Choi, H. (2023). Design strategies for Citizen Strategic Orientation. *Public Management Review*, 1–20.
- Nguyen, D. T. N., & Teo, S. T. T. (2018). HR orientations and HR department effectiveness in Vietnam. *Personnel Review*, 47(5), 1043–1061.
- Ningsih, E. R. (2013). Knowledge management system (kms) dalam meningkatkan inovasi lppm perguruan tinggi. *EVOLUSI: Jurnal Sains Dan Manajemen*, 1(1).
- Patel, G., & Annapoorna, M. S. (2019). Public education expenditure and its impact on human resource development in India: An empirical analysis. *South Asian Journal of Human Resources Management*, 6(1), 97–109.
- Perry, J. L., & Wise, L. R. (1990). The motivational bases of public service. *Public Administration Review*, 367–373.
- Prahalad, C. K., & Hamel, G. (1994). Strategy as a field of study: Why search for a new paradigm? *Strategic Management Journal*, 15(2 S), 5–16. <https://doi.org/10.1002/smj.4250151002>
- Rampersad, H. K. (2006). Personal balanced scorecard : the way to individual happiness, personal integrity, and organizational effectiveness. In [foreword by Jeannette Lee]. *Greenwich (Conn.): IAP Information Age Pub. IAP*.
- Rani, G., Gupta, R. K., & Bhandare, S. A. (2019). Human resource management in an industrial scenario. In *AIP Conference Proceedings* (Vol. 2148). <https://doi.org/10.1063/1.5123968>
- Rustipa, K., Hadiono, K., Mukminin, A., Pukan, E. O., & Nugroho, R. A. (2024). Logical Relations and Noun Phrase Complexity of EFL Students' Academic Writing to Promote Literacy Development Cycle Teaching Model. *International Journal of Learning, Teaching and Educational Research*, 23(3), 199–218.
- Setyono, J. (2015). Good Governance Dalam Perspektif Islam (Pendekatan Ushul Fikih: Teori Peningkatan Norma). *Muqtasid: Jurnal Ekonomi Dan Perbankan Syariah*, 6(1), 25. <https://doi.org/10.18326/muqtasid.v6i1.25-40>
- Slatter, S. S. P. (1980). Strategic planning for public relations. In *Long Range Planning* (Vol. 13, Issue 3). Routledge. [https://doi.org/10.1016/0024-6301\(80\)90124-7](https://doi.org/10.1016/0024-6301(80)90124-7)
- Smith, R. (2020). How CEOs can support employee mental health in a crisis. *Harvard Business Review*, 2.
- Sumbodo, W., & Setiadi, R. (2022). Manajemen Pembelajaran Dalam Pengembangan Karakter Dan Kompetensi. *Konservasi Pendidikan*, 3, 54–87.
- Supriyatna, C. (2024). Analisis Kebutuhan Pengembangan Kompetensi Pegawai Administrasi Umum Golongan II dan III Di Kabupaten Bandung. *Coopetition: Jurnal Ilmiah Manajemen*, 15(1), 177–196.
- Susanti, H. (2021). Manajemen pendidikan, tenaga kependidikan, standar pendidik, dan mutu pendidikan. *Asatiza: Jurnal Pendidikan*, 2(1), 33–48.
- Taylor, J. (2008). Organizational influences, public service motivation and work outcomes: An australian study. *International Public Management Journal*, 11(1), 67–88. <https://doi.org/10.1080/10967490801887921>
- Ubeda-Garcia, M., Claver-Cortés, E., Marco-Lajara, B., Garcia-Lillo, F., & Zaragoza-Sáez, P. (2019). Organizational success, human resources practices and exploration–exploitation learning. *Employee Relations*, 41(6), 1379–1397. <https://doi.org/10.1108/ER-11-2017-0261>
- University of Brawijaya. (2024). *Dokumen Resmi*. University of Brawijaya.

- <https://www.ub.ac.id/id/about/official-documents/>
- Uyyun, N. (2021). Manajemen Sumber Daya Manusia In Manajemen Sumber Daya Manusia. In *Edisi Revisi Jakarta: Bumi Aksara*. CV Rey Media Grafika.
- Walker, R. M., Boyne, G. A., & Brewer, G. A. (2010). *Public management and performance: Research directions*.
- Wang, X., Wilson, J., & Li, W. (2021). An empirical investigation of leadership and human resources capacities as key actors in the implementation of smart education. *Education Sciences*, 11(3), 138.
- Weatherley, R., & Lipsky, M. (1977). Street-level bureaucrats and institutional innovation: Implementing special-education reform. *Harvard Educational Review*, 47(2), 171–197.
- Wright, T. S. A. (2002). Definitions and frameworks for environmental sustainability in higher education. *International Journal of Sustainability in Higher Education*, 3(3), 203–220.
<https://doi.org/10.1108/14676370210434679>