

## **Evaluation of the Implementation of Government Policy on the Provision of Goods and Services at the Public Works and Spatial Planning Department of Banggai Regency**

**Ade Putra Ode Amane<sup>1</sup>, Haminun Dg. Matorang<sup>2</sup>, La Ode Sabirila Jayalangi<sup>3</sup>, Sahraen Sibay<sup>4</sup>, Wildan Zaman<sup>5</sup>, Nurarifin Hi Mufti<sup>6</sup>**

<sup>1,2,3,4,5,6</sup> Government Science Study Program, Faculty of Social and Political Sciences, Muhammadiyah University of Luwuk, Banggai, Indonesia.

Email:putrohade@gmail.com

Inputted : July 10, 2025  
Accepted : August 16, 2025

Revised : August 13, 2025  
Published : August 20, 2025

### **Abstract**

The provision of government goods and services plays a strategic role in supporting national development and economic growth. However, in practice, problems such as fraud, inefficiency, and weak policy implementation are still common. This study aims to evaluate the implementation of government policies in the provision of goods and services at the Public Works and Spatial Planning Agency of Banggai Regency. The focus of this research is to assess the effectiveness of existing policies and regulations and identify factors influencing their implementation in the field. A qualitative approach was used, with data collection techniques including observation, documentation, and in-depth interviews. Three informants were selected through purposive sampling based on their respective areas of responsibility within the Public Works and Spatial Planning Agency of Banggai Regency. The research findings are expected to provide an overview of the strengths and weaknesses in the implementation of goods and services procurement policies, as well as provide recommendations for improving governance. Furthermore, this study is expected to contribute as a reference for further research in the field of public policy, particularly procurement.

**Keywords:** *Government Policy, Procurement of Goods and Services, Policy Evaluation*

### **1. Introduction**

Procurement of goods and services plays a significant role in the national economy. Within the framework of fiscal policy, procurement of goods and services aims to stimulate the economy by creating jobs, increasing foreign investment, and boosting economic growth. Procurement of goods and services, financed in part or in whole by the State Budget/Regional Budget (APBN/APBD), is the procurement of goods and services within the government aimed at providing public goods and services. Improper procurement of goods and services will result in losses to the public, including the low quality of services received from the government, (Dian Wardiana Sjuchro and Andung 2020); (D W Sjuchro and Andung 2020); (Amane, Syaickhu, et al. 2023).

Thus, the effective and efficient provision of goods and services is a key factor in the implementation of government duties, including at the Department of Public Works and Spatial Planning. The PUPR is responsible for managing infrastructure projects and public services involving the provision of goods and services, (Deuskar 2019). However, in its implementation, several issues require evaluation related to government policies that impact the provision of goods and services, (Beard 2019); (Das and Dahiya 2020); (Umiyati et al. 2023a).



Creative Commons Attribution-ShareAlike 4.0 International License:  
<https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-sa/4.0/>

First, government policies related to the provision of goods and services in the PUPR need to be evaluated, (Pierskalla 2019); (Wampler, Sugiyama, and Touchton 2019). These policies include regulations, procurement procedures, budget allocation, and control mechanisms established by the government. This evaluation is conducted to determine whether the policies meet the needs and objectives of the PUPR's provision of goods and services, and whether they have contributed to improving the quantity and quality of goods and services provided to the public, (Hatta et al. 2023).

Second, the Public Works and Housing Agency must initiate implementation of the policy. Ineffective implementation can lead to problems such as budget conceptualization, implementation of conditions, project delays, and low-quality results, (Stupak, Mansoor, and Smith 2021). Evaluating policy implementation will help identify factors that hinder or facilitate the provision of goods and services, (Umiyati et al. 2023b).

In order to overcome the problems faced, the Procurement of goods and services at the Public Works and Spatial Planning Agency of Banggai Regency shows that the constantly changing unit price fluctuations are a problem frequently faced by the agency. Unit price fluctuations can be influenced by various factors, including policies issued by the government or related institutions. For example, regulatory policies related to quality, safety, or environmental standards can impact unit price fluctuations, (Palad et al. 2023); (George, Murray, and Christian 2023); (Webb and Kurtz 2023). The implementation of new regulations that require changes in the production or distribution of goods can increase production costs and potentially affect unit prices.

Several measures can be taken to address unit price fluctuations, such as policy evaluation and monitoring. To identify policy issues or loopholes that impact unit prices, regular evaluation and monitoring of implemented goods and services provision policies are essential, (Johnson, Kishore, dan Berwick 2020); (Coen et al. 2022); (Açar 2022).

In this situation, an evaluation of the implementation of government policies related to the provision of goods and services at the Public Works and Spatial Planning Agency of Banggai Regency was conducted, (Thévenot 2020); (Agus Hendrayady et al. 2022). Although no specific information was available on the issue, it can be concluded that this evaluation was conducted to determine the extent to which government policies were successful in providing goods and services at the Public Works and Spatial Planning Agency of Banggai Regency. In addition, this evaluation can help in identifying problems and obstacles that may arise.

## 2. Method

The type of research used in this study is qualitative. A qualitative approach is used to understand and describe phenomena as they occur naturally, without manipulation, and to explore the deeper meaning of the implementation of goods and services provision policies at the Public Works and Spatial Planning Agency of Banggai Regency. This method allows researchers to record information as it is—whether seen, heard, spoken, or read—as it is from the original source, (Rahman et al. 2022); (Amane dan Laali 2022); (Amane, Kertati, et al. 2023)

Informants in this study were selected purposively, based on specific considerations related to their duties, functions, and knowledge of the research topic. Informants were positioned as the primary data source to obtain information relevant to the focus of the problem being studied. In this case, there are three key informants who represent strategic areas in the implementation of procurement of goods and services within the PUPR Service, (Muslimin et al. 2023); (Agit et al. 2023); (Subakti et al. 2023).

The data analysis process in this study began with collecting data from various sources through observation, documentation, and in-depth interviews. The data was then analyzed using a qualitative descriptive analysis approach, systematically compiling, categorizing, and interpreting the data to gain a comprehensive understanding of the implementation of the policy

in question. The results of the analysis are then used to explain in depth the strengths, weaknesses, and potential for improvement in the policy of providing goods and services, (Alaslan et al. 2023); (Amane, Kertati, et al. 2023); (Razali et al. 2023).

### 3. Results and Discussion

#### Provision of Goods and Services at the PUPR Service of Banggai Regency

The provision of goods and services within the Banggai Regency Public Works and Spatial Planning (PUPR) Department is carried out based on the principles of efficiency, effectiveness, and transparency, (Wibawa and Antarini 2020); (Ho, Shen, and Xu 2023). These three principles are the main pillars of good procurement governance, which aims not only to ensure the optimal use of public funds but also to ensure the achievement of quality results and increase accountability to the public. The principle of efficiency serves to minimize resource waste and maximize the value of each budget expenditure, so that each procurement process produces the greatest benefits at the lowest possible cost. Meanwhile, the principle of effectiveness is crucial in ensuring that infrastructure and public service projects funded through procurement mechanisms truly achieve their stated objectives and quality standards. The principle of transparency, on the other hand, opens up space for broad public access to information, builds public trust, and encourages active participation from various stakeholders in the procurement process, (Amane et al. 2024).

#### The principle of efficiency

The principle of efficiency in evaluating the implementation of goods and services policies at the Public Works and Public Housing Agency is crucial to ensuring optimal use of limited resources. The evaluation should assess the extent to which the efforts expended, the procurement processes implemented, and the budget utilization have achieved the desired results at minimal cost. This principle not only supports procurement effectiveness but also ensures accountability, transparency, and adaptability to change, (Governance for Urban Services, Access, Participation, Accountability, and Transparency 2020); (Winanti and Hanif 2020). By emphasizing efficiency, the Public Works and Housing Agency can ensure that every step taken leads to more effective management of public funds and optimal services for the public, (Krah and Mertens 2020).

Based on an interview with one of the procurement officers at the Public Works and Spatial Planning (PUPR) Department of Banggai Regency, it was revealed that efforts to ensure quality in the procurement process are carried out through strict technical specification checks. As explained by Sulkifli Aliu, S.T., one of the technical officers:

*"So, the quality of goods and services procurement, of course, must first comply with specifications. This means procurement of goods and services includes goods. In this case, procurement of goods includes laptops and printers, and there is a team of goods inspectors. During the handover of goods, they match the specifications in the contract with the goods procured. For air conditioners, they match them to ensure the goods have been procured. For physical projects, there is a technical team that inspects them, and in addition to the technical team, there is also a supervisor. The supervisor checks the conformity of the contract documents with the technical specifications and work methods. Essentially, the conformity of the materials used." (Interview, Wednesday, October 25, 2023).*

#### Effective Principles

The effective principles of procurement of goods and services at the Public Works and Public Housing Agency emphasize achieving development objectives through processes that ensure project outcomes meet established quality standards and specifications, (Jacob et al. 2019); (Pierskalla and Sacks 2020). With a focus on resource optimization, accountability, and contribution to sustainable development goals, these principles are key to ensuring that government policies are implemented effectively, resources are utilized effectively, and infrastructure development outcomes positively impact communities and the environment.

In addition to ensuring the quality of procurement of goods and services, researchers also traced corrective actions taken if discrepancies were found between implementation in the field and the contracted plans or specifications. Based on the results of interviews with one of the technical procurement implementers, Mulsandi, S.T., M.T., information was obtained that firm steps would be taken to ensure that the provider fulfills its obligations under the contract:

*"Told to dismantle it, told to replace it, told to repair it again, there was a warning to repair it again, according to the standards of what was contracted." (Interview, Wednesday, October 11 2023).*

This statement demonstrates that the Banggai Regency Public Works and Public Housing Agency implements a strict monitoring and evaluation mechanism for the procurement process. If any discrepancies are found, the service provider is required to dismantle, replace, or repair the work until it meets the standards and provisions stipulated in the contract. Furthermore, warnings are also part of the control instrument to ensure compliance with technical specifications.

### **Transparent Principle**

The principle of transparency in the procurement of goods and services at the Public Works and Public Housing Agency emphasizes open information, clear publication, and public participation. This involves disclosing the entire procurement process, including the legal basis and mechanisms governing it, and publishing information through various media. Public and stakeholder participation in the procurement process is also emphasized, ensuring that policies adopted reflect community needs, (Fernandes, Lopes, and Sargent 2019); (Vargas-Payera, Martínez-Reyes, and Ejderyan 2020); (Ocelík, Lehotský, and Černoch 2021). The principle of transparency is important to prevent corruption, increase public trust, and improve the quality of procurement of goods and services, creating an environment of integrity, accountability, and trustworthiness in the implementation of government policies related to the provision of goods and services at the PUPR Service.

In the procurement process of goods and services, the auction announcement mechanism is one of the important stages to ensure transparency and equal access to information for all prospective suppliers. Based on the results of interviews with the technical procurement implementer at the PUPR Office of Banggai Regency, Sulkifli Aliu, S.T., an overview of the auction announcement procedures in effect at the agency was obtained:

*"That's the case with the Procurement Services Unit (ULP). We have projects up for tender, with budgets exceeding 200 million Rupiah. We submit them there with complete requirements, such as technical documents, applications, and terms of reference. Once everything is complete, we take it to the ULP, where we have a meeting. The meeting usually involves several discussions. Once it's ready to go live, they publish it on their website, called the Banggai Regency LPSE." (Interview, Wednesday, October 25, 2023).*

The statement indicates that procurement projects valued above Rp 200 million are processed through the Procurement Services Unit (ULP). The PUPR Agency is responsible for preparing the necessary documents, including technical documents, application letters, and Terms of Reference (TOR). Once the documents were complete, a series of meetings with the ULP (Procurement Implementation Unit) were held to discuss and refine the process before the auction announcement. The announcement was then officially published through the Banggai Regency Electronic Procurement Service (LPSE), which serves as the primary medium for disseminating information to prospective goods and services providers.

### **Evaluation of Government Implementation Policy on the Provision of Goods and Services by the PUPR Service of Banggai Regency**

Evaluation of government policy implementation is a comprehensive assessment process of a policy's implementation, aimed at assessing its effectiveness, efficiency, relevance, and impact on society and the environment, (Černoch et al. 2019); (Balzan-Alzate et al. 2021). In this context, evaluation includes assessing the extent to which policy objectives have been achieved, the efficiency of resource utilization, the policy's relevance to current conditions,

stakeholder participation, social and economic impacts, and the fairness of policy implementation. The results of this evaluation provide crucial information for policy makers to make improvements, adjustments, or develop policies to increase quality, transparency, and accountability in an effort to achieve the desired goals.

## Functional Evaluation

In evaluating goods and services provision policies, the functional principle views evaluation as more than an administrative procedure, but rather an integral part of the overall policy cycle, serving to strengthen the implementation process, foster organizational learning, and generate constructive recommendations. Evaluation, in this context, serves as a means to ensure that implemented policies deliver optimal benefits, meet expected performance standards, and align with actual needs on the ground, (Indrawati, Ragamustari, and Wijaya 2021); (Massey 2022); (Parker and Vogl 2023).

In this regard, researchers explored how the project needs identification process is carried out during the planning stage as the initial part of the goods and services procurement policy cycle. Based on interviews with the technical implementer at the Banggai Regency Public Works and Public Housing Agency, Mulsandi, S.T., M.T., explained that the needs identification process is carried out systematically by involving various proposal sources:

*"So, at the PUPR Agency, identifying project needs is part of the planning process because we follow existing planning mechanisms. So, activity proposals actually started in the e-1 fiscal year. In 2022, those proposals came from the Musrenbang (Regional Development Planning Forum)—participatory planning, as it comes from the grassroots (community), technocrats (the agency), and then from the results of the DPRD recess. Then, we'll review all of that. The proposed activities must be linked to the regional head's vision and mission outlined in the RPJMD. The activities must be synchronized. So, those are the activities we've screened, from the Musrenbang (Resident Development Planning Forum), from recess, from technocrats, included in the Renja (Work Plan), and from the agencies we'll propose them later. We'll look at the budget and the priority scale of those activities. That's what we'll be surveying. "Because there are so many proposals, and the budget isn't enough to cover them all, we're prioritizing them. Based on the results of the Work Plan, we've begun to identify plans for next year's proposed activities. That's what's outlined in the budget document." (Interview, Wednesday, October 11, 2023).*

This statement demonstrates that the Public Works and Housing Agency (PUPR) implements a planning process that embraces a participatory and technocratic approach, incorporating input from the Regional Development Planning Conference (Musrenbang), the results of regional legislative council (DPRD) recesses, and the agency's own technical proposals. All proposals are screened based on their relevance to the regional head's vision and mission in the RPJMD (Regional Medium-Term Development Plan), and prioritized based on budget availability and field survey results.

## Performance Evaluation

Performance evaluation in the context of goods and services policy implementation at the Public Works and Public Housing Agency (PUPR) includes assessing efficiency, effectiveness of outcomes, and achievement of policy objectives. This involves key questions about optimizing resource use, the impact of infrastructure projects on public services, and the extent to which policy objectives are achieved. Performance evaluation principles are important because they provide a basis for accountability, support informed decision-making, increase transparency, lead to more efficient resource use, and enable organizational learning from past experiences, (Tilley et al. 2019); (Chen et al. 2021). By evaluating policy implementation holistically, performance evaluation helps ensure that implemented policies have the desired positive impacts and support the development of sustainable infrastructure and housing development.

One important aspect in the procurement process of goods and services is the evaluation of bids from potential providers, which aims to ensure that the selected provider truly meets all technical and administrative requirements in accordance with the provisions in the procurement

documents. Based on the results of interviews with the technical implementer at the PUPR Office of Banggai Regency, Fahrullah Efendy Lodik, S.T., it was explained that the evaluation process was carried out systematically and based on information technology:

*"The bid evaluation consists of qualification and technical evaluations. This includes an evaluation of compliance with all requirements outlined in the tender documents. The entire process is conducted online through the LPSE application at the UKPBJ (Procurement and Public Works Agency) in Banggai Regency." (Interview, Tuesday, October 17, 2023).*

The entire evaluation process is conducted electronically through the LPSE (Electronic Procurement Services) application, coordinated by the Banggai Regency Goods/Services Procurement Work Unit (UKPBJ). The use of the LPSE system reflects the principles of transparency and accountability, as it allows for digital recording of all evaluation stages, allows for oversight, and minimizes manual intervention that could potentially lead to irregularities.

### **Systematic**

Systematic evaluation in the context of goods and services policy at the Department of Public Works and Public Housing (PUPR) characterizes a holistic approach involving a comprehensive analysis of all aspects of the policy. The primary focus is analyzing the achievement of policy objectives, including implementation performance and impact on the community. This evaluation includes monitoring policy implementation, detailing how programs are implemented, identifying constraints, and evaluating the effectiveness and efficiency of the utilization of the resulting goods and services. The importance of systematic evaluation lies in its ability to improve policy effectiveness by providing in-depth insights, monitoring implementation, establishing accountability, and providing a basis for informed decision-making. As a tool that provides recommendations for improvement, systematic evaluation plays a key role in helping the Public Works and Housing Agency (PUPR) create better policies in the future, ensuring transparency, and enhancing the sustainability of implemented policies, (Nadjib and Bafadhal 2020); (Pierskalla and Sacks 2020); (Newcomer et al. 2023).

The final stage in the procurement process for goods and services is the signing of a contract between the selected provider and the budget user. Based on an interview with Fahrullah Efendy Lodik, S.T., the procurement technical implementer at the Banggai Regency Public Works and Public Housing Agency, it was explained that the contract signing process was carried out systematically and in stages in accordance with applicable regulations:

*"That means there are steps. The first is the issuance of the SPPBJ, followed by the contract signing, which begins with a show-post meeting, a pre-construction meeting, the submission of the performance guarantee, and the commencement of work." (Interview, Tuesday, October 17, 2023).*

This procedure demonstrates that the Banggai Regency Public Works and Public Housing Agency implements a contract signing process based on good governance, taking into account legal aspects, technical readiness, and implementation commitment. This aligns with the principles of accountability and legal certainty, which are crucial in ensuring the quality and smooth implementation of procurement projects.



**Gambar 1.** Interview with the Head of the Building and Settlement Infrastructure Planning Division (Sulkifli Aliu, S.T.) and the Head of the Drinking Water, Wastewater and Garbage Management Division (Mulsandi, S.T., M.T)

#### 4. Conclusion

An evaluation of the implementation of government policies regarding the provision of goods and services at the Public Works and Spatial Planning (PUPR) Department of Banggai Regency shows that, in general, the policies have been implemented in accordance with applicable regulations. The procurement process is conducted based on the principles of effectiveness, efficiency, and transparency, as mandated by government procurement regulations. However, several aspects significantly influence the successful implementation of this policy. These factors include coordination between the parties involved, the quality of human resources (HR), and internal oversight mechanisms. Suboptimal coordination can hinder the smooth running of the procurement process, while uneven human resource capacity in understanding technical procurement regulations also poses a challenge. Furthermore, the ineffectiveness of the oversight system has the potential for irregularities and discrepancies in the implementation process. These findings highlight the importance of strengthening cross-unit coordination, enhancing staff competency through ongoing training, and improving oversight mechanisms to be more responsive and accountable. This will further enhance the effectiveness of the implementation of goods and services procurement policies within the Public Works and Housing Agency.

#### References

- Açar, Kemal Veli. 2022. “On a global child protection fund financed by international tech companies.” *Global Policy* 14(1): 162–72.
- Agit, Alamsyah et al. 2023. *Metodologi Penelitian Kuantitatif & Kualitatif*. Pertama. ed. Syaiful Bahri. Bandung: Media Sains Indonesia.
- Agus Hendrayady et al. 2022. *PENGANTAR ILMU ADMINISTRASI PUBLIK*. Pertama. ed. Agus Hendrayady. Purbalingga: EUREKA MEDIA AKSARA.
- Alaslan, Amtai et al. 2023. Perkumpulan Rumah Cemerlang Indonesia (PRCI) *Metode Penelitian Kualitatif*. Pertama. ed. Achmad Hidir. Tasikmalaya.
- Amane, Ade Putra Ode, Ahmad Syaickhu, et al. 2023. *Manajemen Sektor Publik*. Pertama. ed. Anny Riwayati. Gowa-Makassar: CV. Ayrada Mandiri.
- Amane, Ade Putra Ode, Indra Kertati, et al. 2023. *METODE PENELITIAN KUALITATIF (Perspektif bidang ilmu Sosial)*. Pertama. ed. Efitra dan Sepriano. Jambi: PT. Sonpedia

- Publishing Indonesia.
- Amane, Ade Putra Ode et al. 2024. PT. Mafi Media Literasi Indonesia *Pengembangan Wilayah dan Perkotaan Di Indonesia*. Pertama. ed. Andi Asari. Solok.
- Amane, Ade Putra Ode, dan Sri Ayu Laali. 2022. *Metode Penelitian*. Pertama. ed. Lasaudin. Kota Baru: Insan Cendekia Mandiri.
- Balzan-Alzate, D et al. 2021. “An Online Survey to Explore the Awareness and Acceptance of Geothermal Energy among an Educated Segment of the Population in Five European and American Countries.” *Geothermal Energy* 9(1).
- Beard, V A. 2019. “Community-Based Planning, Collective Action and the Challenges of Confronting Urban Poverty in Southeast Asia.” *Environment and Urbanization* 31(2): 575–96.
- Černoch, F et al. 2019. “Anti-Fossil Frames: Examining Narratives of the Opposition to Brown Coal Mining in the Czech Republic.” *Energy Research and Social Science* 54: 140–49.
- Chen, Guoyi, Shangmin Zhang, Bangquan Yan, dan Shengzhen Miao. 2021. “Environmental safety evaluation of geopark based on CPTED concept and fuzzy comprehensive analysis.” *PLOS ONE* 16(11): e0260316.
- Coen, David, Julia Kreienkamp, Alexandros Tokhi, dan Tom Pegram. 2022. “Making global public policy work: A survey of international organization effectiveness.” *Global Policy* 13(5): 656–68.
- Das, A, dan B Dahiya. 2020. “Towards Inclusive Urban Governance and Planning: Emerging Trends and Future Trajectories.” *Advances in 21st Century Human Settlements*: 353–84.
- Deuskar, C. 2019. “Clientelism and Planning in the Informal Settlements of Developing Democracies.” *Journal of Planning Literature* 34(4): 395–407.
- Fernandes, M E, A S Lopes, dan A L Sargent. 2019. “Improving Stakeholder Engagement in Local Strategic Planning—Experience Sharing Based on Portuguese Examples.” *Policy Studies*.
- George, Phoebe, Kevin Murray, dan Hayley Christian. 2023. “Young children’s use of blue spaces and the impact on their health, development and environmental awareness: A qualitative study from parents’ perspectives.” *Health Promotion Journal of Australia. Governance for Urban Services, Access, Participation, Accountability, and Transparency*. 2020.
- Hatta, Herman et al. 2023. *Model-Model Pelatihan Dan Pengembangan SDM*. Pertama. ed. Evi Damayanti. Bandung: Widina Bhakti Persada.
- Ho, Alfred Tat-Kei, Chen Shen, dan Yan Xu. 2023. “In search of public values in performance budgeting studies.” *Public Administration Review*.
- Indrawati, Retno, Safendri Komara Ragamustari, dan Muhammad Ery Wijaya. 2021. “Best Practice in Early Childhood Development Financial Governance: A Case Study in Indonesia Villages.” *Jurnal Pendidikan Usia Dini* 15(2): 319–41.
- Jacob, D W, M F M Fudzee, M A Salamat, dan T Herawan. 2019. “A Review of the Generic End-User Adoption of e-Government Services.” *International Review of Administrative Sciences* 85(4): 799–818.
- Johnson, Micah, Sanjay Kishore, dan Donald M Berwick. 2020. “Medicare For All: An Analysis Of Key Policy Issues.” *Health Affairs* 39(1): 133–41.
- Krah, R, dan G Mertens. 2020. “Democracy and Financial Transparency of Local Governments in Sub-Saharan Africa.” *Meditari Accountancy Research* 28(4): 681–99.
- Massey, Andrew. 2022. “Sustainable Development Goals and their Fit with Good Governance.” *Global Policy* 13(S1): 79–85.
- Muslimin, Dian et al. 2023. *Global Eksekutif Teknologi Metodologi Penelitian Kuantitatif dan Kualitatif*. Pertama. ed. Nanny Mayasari. Padang.
- Nadjib, A, dan O M Bafadhal. 2020. “How Social Capital Works: The Role of Social Capital in Acts of Corruption.” *International Journal of Psychosocial Rehabilitation* 24(3): 2424–

33.

- Newcomer, Kathryn E et al. 2023. "From noise to knowledge: Improving evidentiary standards for program efficacy to better inform public policy and management decisions." *Public Administration Review* 83(5): 1051–71.
- Ocelík, P, L Lehotský, dan F Černoch. 2021. "Beyond Our Backyard: Social Networks, Differential Participation, and Local Opposition to Coal Mining in Europe." *Energy Research and Social Science* 72.
- Palad, Yves Y et al. 2023. "An Evaluation of Policies Promoting Physical Activity among Filipino Youth." *International Journal of Environmental Research and Public Health* 20(4): 2865.
- Parker, Susan W, dan Tom Vogl. 2023. "Do Conditional Cash Transfers Improve Economic Outcomes in the Next Generation? Evidence from Mexico." *The Economic Journal* 133(655): 2775–2806.
- Pierskalla, J H. 2019. "The Proliferation of Decentralized Governing Units." In *Decentralized Governance and Accountability: Academic Research and the Future of Donor Programming*, The Ohio State University, United States: Cambridge University Press, 115–43.
- Pierskalla, J H, dan A Sacks. 2020. "Personnel Politics: Elections, Clientelistic Competition and Teacher Hiring in Indonesia." *British Journal of Political Science* 50(4): 1283–1305.
- Rahman, Abdul et al. 2022. *Metode Penelitian Ilmu Sosial*. Pertama. ed. Aas Masruroh. Bandung: Widina Media Utama.
- Razali, Geofakta et al. 2023. *Metode Penelitian Kuantitatif, Kualitatif, dan Kombinasi*. Pertama. ed. Syaiful Bahri. Bandung: Media Sains Indonesia.
- Sjuchro, D W, dan P A Andung. 2020. "Rural Community in Indonesia in Their Fight for Governance Transparency through Radio ." *Utopia y Praxis Latinoamericana* 25(Extra10): 78–91.
- Sjuchro, Dian Wardiana, dan Petrus Ana Andung. 2020. "Rural community in Indonesia in their fight for governance transparency through radio." *Utopia y Praxis Latinoamericana* 25(Extra10): 78–91.
- Stupak, Inge, Maha Mansoor, dan C. Tattersall Smith. 2021. "Conceptual framework for increasing legitimacy and trust of sustainability governance." *Energy, Sustainability and Society* 11(1).
- Subakti, Hani et al. 2023. *Metodologi Penelitian Kualitatif*. Pertama. ed. Syaiful Bahri. Bandung: Media Sains Indonesia.
- Thévenot, L. 2020. "How Does Politics Take Closeness into Account? Returns from Russia." *International Journal of Politics, Culture and Society* 33(2): 221–50.
- Tilley, A et al. 2019. "Evaluating the Fit of Co-Management for Small-Scale Fisheries Governance in Timor-Leste." *Frontiers in Marine Science* 6(JUL).
- Umiyati, Hesti et al. 2023a. *Tata Kelola Sektor Publik*. Pertama. ed. Aas Masruroh. Bandung: Widina Bhakti Persada.
- . 2023b. *TATA KELOLA SEKTOR PUBLIK*. Pertama. ed. Aas Masruroh. Bandung: Widina Bhakti Persada.
- Vargas-Payera, S, A Martínez-Reyes, dan O Ejderyan. 2020. "Factors and Dynamics of the Social Perception of Geothermal Energy: Case Study of the Tolhuaca Exploration Project in Chile." *Geothermics* 88.
- Wampler, B, N B Sugiyama, dan M Touchton. 2019. Democracy at Work: Pathways to Well-Being in Brazil *Democracy at Work: Pathways to Well-Being in Brazil*. Boise State University, United States: Cambridge University Press.
- Webb, Romany M, dan Lauren Kurtz. 2023. "Politics v. science: How President Trump's war on science impacted public health and environmental regulation." In , 65–80.
- Wibawa, I Gede Agus, dan Lilik Antarini. 2020. "Sistem Digital Tata Kelola Pemerintahan

- Daerah (Digital Local Government)." *Public Inspiration: Jurnal Administrasi Publik* 5(1): 57–71.
- Winanti, P S, dan H Hanif. 2020. "When Global Norms Meet Local Politics: Localising Transparency in Extractive Industries Governance." *Environmental Policy and Governance* 30(5): 263–75.